Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law - Volume V

Jonathan L. Black-Branch · Dieter Fleck Editors

Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law - Volume V

Legal Challenges for Nuclear Security and Deterrence





Editors
Jonathan L. Black-Branch
Faculty of Law
University of Manitoba
Winnipeg, MB, Canada

Dieter Fleck Cologne, Germany

Published by T.M.C. ASSER PRESS, The Hague, The Netherlands www.asserpress.nl Produced and distributed for T.M.C. ASSER PRESS by Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg

© T.M.C. ASSER PRESS and the authors 2020

No part of this work may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, microfilming, recording or otherwise, without written permission from the Publisher, with the exception of any material supplied specifically for the purpose of being entered and executed on a computer system, for exclusive use by the purchaser of the work. The use of general descriptive names, registered names, trademarks, service marks, etc. in this publication does not imply, even in the absence of a specific statement, that such names are exempt from the relevant protective laws and regulations and therefore free for general use.

This T.M.C. ASSER PRESS imprint is published by the registered company Springer-Verlag GmbH, DE part of Springer Nature.

The registered company address is: Heidelberger Platz 3, 14197 Berlin, Germany

Preface

This volume focuses on various legal aspects regarding nuclear security assurances and nuclear deterrence. It is part of an in-depth longitudinal study of the Nuclear Non-Proliferation Treaty (NPT), a treaty that despite its large number of State Parties and indefinite extension in 1995 is the object of continuing concern requiring monitoring and further study to assist in moving its objectives forward.

In order to fully address this concern and work towards realistic solutions, independent experts are cooperating in conjunction with ISLAND (International Society of Law and Nuclear Disarmament) and the International Law Association's Committee on Nuclear Weapons, Non-Proliferation and Contemporary International Law, which has reported at the biennial ILA Conferences in Sofia (2012), Washington (2014), Johannesburg (2016), and most recently in Sydney (2018), and will submit a draft Declaration on Legal Issues of Nuclear Weapons, Nuclear Non-Proliferation and Peaceful Uses of Nuclear Energy in due course.²

Volume I of the book series started with an exposé of relevant legal issues and international concerns, identifying and addressing a variety of critical questions that require strict and full application of rules emanating from various fields of international law and practice.³ Volume II provided an in-depth critical review of aspects of verification and compliance, assisting to develop international consensus on disputed issues regarding the legal application, which remains essential both from a theoretical perspective and from the practice of States and international organizations.⁴ Volume III focused on legal aspects of the use of nuclear energy for

¹ Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (1 July 1968), 729 UNTS 161.

² See Committee on Nuclear Weapons, Non-Proliferation and Contemporary International Law, http://www.ila-hq.org/index.php/committees.

³ Black-Branch J/Fleck D (eds) (2014) Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law, Vol I with a Foreword by Mohamed ElBaradei, T.M.C. Asser Press.

⁴ Black-Branch J/Fleck D (eds) (2015) Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law, Vol II Verification and Compliance, T.M.C. Asser Press.

vi Preface

peaceful purposes, considering the role of States and international organizations, and presenting a number of suggestions for international cooperation. Volume IV emphasized different human perspectives on the use of nuclear energy, examining the need for regional solutions, and the revived interest on a global scale in prohibiting and fully abolishing nuclear weapons. Taken together, these contributions provide a comprehensive assessment of the three central pillars of the NPT-non-proliferation, nuclear energy for peaceful uses and disarmament, following contemporary developments including the adoption of the Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons in 2017.

This present volume comes at an important juncture, just prior to the 10th NPT Review Conference (2020). Its main body of contributions is the result of a research conference on *Regional Nuclear Non-Proliferation and Disarmament: Controls, Defence and Diplomacy*, held at the Canadian Museum for Human Rights in Winnipeg from September 20–21, 2018, followed by a Round Table on *Legal Challenges for Nuclear Deterrence and Nuclear Security* (London, March 25–26, 2019).

We would like to express our sincere gratitude to David G. Newman Q. C. and Brenda Newman for generously supporting our meetings and personally supporting our work with critical comments, questions and encouragement. A special thanks is extended to Marcia Kort, Executive Assistant to the Dean; Christine Mazur, Marketing and Communications Officer; and Jason Poettcker, the Dean's Research Assistant, for their work in assisting to organize the Winnipeg conference. Special acknowledgement is also extended to our peer reviewers who have offered their critical advice, encouragement and invaluable suggestions in a double anonymous review process. T.M.C. Asser Press/Springer has helped to secure the publication of this book series in a very professional and effective manner: we thank Frank Bakker and his team for their outstanding interest, professional diligence and encouragement.

Winnipeg, Canada Cologne, Germany June 2019 Jonathan L. Black-Branch Dieter Fleck

⁵ Black-Branch J/Fleck D (eds) (2016) Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law, Vol III Legal Aspects of the Use of Nuclear Energy for Peaceful Purposes, T.M.C. Asser Press.

⁶ Black-Branch J/Fleck D (eds) (2018) Nuclear Non-Proliferation in International Law, Vol IV Human Perspectives on the Development and Use of Nuclear Energy, T.M.C. Asser Press.

⁷ Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons, UN Doc A/CONF.229/2017/8 (7 July 2017).

Contents

1	Jonathan Black-Branch and Dieter Fleck	
Par	t I Global Issues and Concerns	
2	Questioning International Nuclear Weapons Law as a Field of Resistance	11
3	The NPT—CTBT Connection	31
4	Planning for Disaster—Lessons from the 2011 Tohoku Disaster Will Galloway	53
5	The Legal Regime of the Use of Nuclear Power Sources in Space Missions	7 3
6	The 2016 ILC Draft Articles on the Protection of Persons in the Event of Disasters and Their Relevance for Victims of Nuclear Accidents and Use of Nuclear Weapons	93
7	Sanctions in Nuclear Non-Proliferation Law	129
Par	t II Regional Matters	
8	The Unclassical Match Between Brazil and Argentina: Past and Present of the Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone in Latin America and the Caribbean	151

viii Contents

9	Lessons from South Africa's Voluntary Denuclearisation Process and the African Continent's Position on Nuclear Weapons Yolandi Meyer	169
10	Foreign Assistance in Establishing and Operating Nuclear Power Plants: The South African Experience Yolandi Meyer	191
11	Small Modular Reactors in Canada: Eroding Public Oversight and Canada's Transition to Sustainable Development	209
Par	t III New Approaches Towards Nuclear Disarmament	
12	Understanding Nuclear Deterrence Within the International Constitutional Architecture	237
13	Running Out of (Legal) Excuses: Extended Nuclear Deterrence in the Era of the Prohibition Treaty	269
14	The Link Between Nuclear Disarmament and the 2030 Agenda for Sustainable Development Goals	291
15	Possible Means to Overcome Tendencies of the Nuclear Weapons Ban Treaty to Erode the NPT	305
16	Precarious Peace: Nuclear Deterrence and Defence Doctrines of Nuclear-Weapon States in the Post-Cold War Era	323
17	Legal Aspects of Nuclear Weapons Doctrines	351
Ind	ex	393

Abbreviations

ABACC

Brazilian-Argentine Agency for Accounting and Control of Nuclear Materials AP I Protocol Additional to the Geneva Conventions of 12 August 1949 and Relating to the Protection of Victims of International Armed Conflicts (1977)**BWC** Biological Weapons Convention (1972) Comprehensive Nuclear Test-Ban Treaty (1996) **CTBT** CTBTO Preparatory Commission for the Comprehensive Nuclear Test-Ban Organization **CWC** Convention on the Prohibition of the Development, Production, Stockpiling and Use of Chemical Weapons and on Their Destruction (1993)EU European Union HEU Highly Enriched Uranium IAEA International Agency for Atomic Energy International Court of Justice **ICJ** International Committee of the Red Cross **ICRC** IHL International Humanitarian Law ILA International Law Association ILC International Law Commission MAD Mutually Assured Destruction **NNWS** Non-nuclear-weapon States **NPT** Treaty on the Non-Proliferation of Nuclear Weapons (1968) **NWFZ** Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone Outer Space Treaty (1967) OST Partial Test Ban Treaty (1963) **PTBT** SALT Strategic Arms Limitation Talks SC Security Council **SORT** Strategic Offensive Reductions Treaty Strategic Arms Reduction Treaty START

x Abbreviations

TPNW Treaty on the Prohibition of Nuclear Weapons (2017)

UN United Nations

UNIDIR United Nations Institute for Disarmament Research

UNTS United Nations Treaty Series

US United States

WHO World Health Organization